



May 27, 2021

Via Electronic Mail

Attn: Gregg Horton

Re: Request for Public Records Received 3/16/2021

Dear Gregg Horton:

The City of Benicia ("City") is in receipt of your email request seeking:

"Any emails, written communications, documents, contracts, presentations, or other communications between officials from the Benicia Police Department and officials from the company "Flock Safety."

In your request, you further describe that this request includes:

"Benicia Police Department records of any kind, including electronic records, audiotapes, videotapes, and photographs, as well as letters, emails, facsimiles, telephone messages, voice mail messages and transcripts, notes, and minutes of any meetings. The search should be limited to responsive records created between January 1, 2019 and the day the request is fulfilled."

This letter shall serve as the City's further formal written response to your request under the California Public Records Act (Government Code section 6250 *et seq.*). A copy of your request is enclosed for reference.

I would like to contact you to discuss ways to narrow this search so that the City can provide more specific records in a quicker fashion. Please contact me at your earliest convenience to discuss.

The City wishes to cooperate to the fullest extent possible with the Public Records Act. Under established California law, the City is obliged to comply with a request for a public record so long as the requester makes a specific and focused request for information, that information is maintained by the City in its ordinary course of business, the information is disclosable, and the record can be located with reasonable effort. The

Public Records Act provides for the inspection or copying of existing identifiable public records; it does not compel the City to create new records, lists, privilege logs, or reports in response to a request.

The City is required to determine whether the request, in whole or in part, seeks copies of disclosable public records. Pursuant to the California Public Records Act (Government Code §§6250 *et seq.*), such determination must take place within ten (10) days of the City's receipt of the request, unless the requestor is advised that more time is needed. In my April 9, 2021 letter, I stated that the City had determined that your request seeks disclosable records, and that due to the voluminous size of the response to your request, the City would produce these responsive documents on a rolling schedule, with documents provided by Friday of each week, until all responsive records have been sent.

Since City Hall is closed tomorrow, I am sending this week's response today. I am enclosing a copy of the next grouping of responsive files in response to your request.

Please note that a portion of this request seeks information related to pricing before the final contract has been executed. As such some of the information is has been redacted as the public interest in nondisclosure outweighs the public interest in disclosure until negotiations are fully complete. (Government Code Section 6255(a), and Michaelis, Montanari & Johnson v. Superior Court (2006) 38 Cal.4th 1065, 1073)

The next response will be sent on or before next Friday, June 4th, 2021.

If you have any questions about this response, or if you would like to discuss ways to narrow your search so that the City can provide more specific records in a quicker fashion, please feel free to contact me directly at jbergstrom@ci.benicia.ca.us or 707-746-4200.

Sincerely,



Jennifer Bergstrom
Deputy City Clerk

cc: Benjamin Stock, City Attorney
Erik Upson, City Manager
Michael Greene, Police Chief
Lisa Wolfe, City Clerk
File

From: [Jennifer Bergstrom](#)
To: [Jennifer Bergstrom](#)
Subject: FW: California Public Records Act Request: Benicia Police Department: Flock Safety
Date: Friday, March 26, 2021 4:41:37 PM

From: 109813-60721929@requests.muckrock.com [<mailto:109813-60721929@requests.muckrock.com>]
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 8:16 PM
To: Ben Stock
Subject: California Public Records Act Request: Benicia Police Department: Flock Safety

Benicia Police Department
PRA Office
200 East L. Street
Benicia, CA 94510

March 16, 2021

To Whom It May Concern:

Pursuant to the California Public Records Act, I hereby request the following records:

Any emails, written communications, documents, contracts, presentations, or other communications between officials from the Benicia Police Department and officials from the company "Flock Safety."

We seek Benicia Police Department records of any kind, including electronic records, audiotapes, videotapes, and photographs, as well as letters, emails, facsimiles, telephone messages, voice mail messages and transcripts, notes, and minutes of any meetings. The search should be limited to responsive records created between January 1, 2019 and the day the request is fulfilled.

In the event some portions of the requested records are properly exempt from disclosure, please disclose any reasonably segregable non-exempt portions of the requested records. If it is your position that a document contains non-exempt segments, but that those non-exempt segments are so dispersed throughout the document as to make segregation impossible, please state what portion of the document is non-exempt, and how the material is dispersed throughout the document. If a request is denied in whole, please state specifically that it is not reasonable to segregate portions of the record for release.

The requested documents will be made available to the general public, and this request is not being made for commercial purposes.

In the event that there are fees, I would be grateful if you would inform me of the total charges in advance of fulfilling my request. I would prefer the request filled electronically, by e-mail attachment if available or CD-ROM if not.

Thank you in advance for your anticipated cooperation in this matter. I look forward to receiving your response to this request within 10 calendar days, as the statute requires.

Sincerely,

Gregg Horton

Filed via MuckRock.com

E-mail (Preferred): 109813-60721929@requests.muckrock.com

Upload documents directly: https://accounts.muckrock.com/accounts/login/?next=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.muckrock.com%2Faccounts%2Flogin%2F%3Fnext%3D%252Faccounts%252Fagency_login%252Fbenicia-police-department-19519%252Fbenicia-police-department-flock-safety-109813%252F%253Femail%253DHmclaughlin%252540ci.benicia.ca.us&url_auth_token=AABuRYGfg02ZPkwcm_g37CE-ntE%3AIIIMMes%3AomjnyEmPsjYo_pU7ynlR8BE-JBA

https://accounts.muckrock.com/accounts/login/?next=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.muckrock.com%2Faccounts%2Flogin%2F%3Fnext%3D%252Faccounts%252Fagency_login%252Fbenicia-police-department-19519%252Fbenicia-police-department-flock-safety-109813%252F%253Femail%253DHmclaughlin%252540ci.benicia.ca.us&url_auth_token=AABuRYGfg02ZPkwcm_g37CE-ntE%3AIIIMMes%3AomjnyEmPsjYo_pU7ynlR8BE-JBA

Is this email coming to the wrong contact? Something else wrong? Use the above link to let us know.

For mailed responses, please address (see note):

MuckRock News
DEPT MR 109813
411A Highland Ave
Somerville, MA 02144-2516

PLEASE NOTE: This request is not filed by a MuckRock staff member, but is being sent through MuckRock by the above in order to better track, share, and manage public records requests. Also note that improperly addressed (i.e., with the requester's name rather than "MuckRock News" and the department number) requests might be returned as undeliverable.



From: [John Anderson](#)
To: [Fwaak Manzoor](#)
Subject: Re: Flock Quotes
Date: Monday, November 30, 2020 11:41:37 AM
Attachments: [image001.jpg](#)

Hi Fwaak, it sounds like you're referring to those clear covers that make it so the plate doesn't reflect, but they're clear-ish so they can still be read.

We're able to get those reliably. This is possible because our system takes images based on movement whereas most other LPR solutions take images when they detect an IR reflection from a license plate. I believe that those covers are supposed to defeat the IR reflection so the legacy LPR solutions don't receive the "trigger" to take an image. Flock's "trigger" is movement so this is a non-issue because of how we've designed the technology.

Once we have the image, we're applying AI/Machine Vision to it. Your detectives would be able to read the plate if they saw a vehicle with one of those covers driving around, and so would our software.

I just added a few relevant slides to the presentation. Take a look at what I added starting at slide #22...The most relevant one is slide #26. The vehicle pictured has one of those covers on it and we were able to successfully read the plate AND send out a Hotlist alert on it.

Does this answer your question?

Thanks,

John

John Anderson
Territory Manager, Northern California
Flock Safety
408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



On Mon, Nov 30, 2020 at 11:22 AM Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us> wrote:

Hi John,

There are plate covers available in the market that allows for cameras to not pickup license plates. What happens in this case?

From: John Anderson <john.anderson@flocksafety.com>
Sent: Monday, November 23, 2020 9:43 AM
To: Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us>
Subject: Re: Flock Quotes

Great, don't hesitate to ask if there's anything else I can do to help with this.

John

John Anderson

Territory Manager, Northern California

Flock Safety

408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



On Mon, Nov 23, 2020 at 9:30 AM Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us> wrote:

Thank You John! I was not here on Friday. I have forwarded the information to the Captain and LT lets see what they come back with. Looks great!

From: John Anderson <john.anderson@flocksafety.com>

Sent: Monday, November 23, 2020 9:26 AM

To: Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us>

Subject: Re: Flock Quotes

Good morning Fwaak, just wanted to confirm...How do those slides look? Is there anything you'd like me to change, update, etc?

Also, I'd be more than happy to join in on the meeting with the Chief if for no reason other than to answer questions.

Thanks,

John

John Anderson

Territory Manager, Northern California

Flock Safety

408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



On Thu, Nov 19, 2020 at 6:20 PM John Anderson <john.anderson@flocksafety.com> wrote:

FW: Thank you for your patience but apologies for the delay. I don't usually have 4 big installs within 2 weeks so it's been a little crazy, and I spend a lot of time customizing these for every agency.

Here is a link to your Quote/Solution Summary:

[REDACTED]

I have a slide in there with the pricing, but it's incredibly simple. [REDACTED]

You're by no means expected to be an expert on Flock so I'd be more than happy to participate in a meeting with the Chief to answer any questions that come up.

On a personal, putting these solutions together is one of my favorite parts of this job and I love that the initial map you sent over is basically my ideal solution for Benicia. When I look at the City Wide Coverage map (slide 6) I can't help but think that if Benicia had this solution, a person would have to be crazy to commit a crime in your city.

What is your feedback on these slides? I'd be more than happy to make changes or adjust based on what's important to your team.

Thanks,

John

John Anderson

Territory Manager, Northern California

Flock Safety

408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



On Thu, Nov 19, 2020 at 1:04 PM Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us> wrote:

Thank You!

From: John Anderson <john.anderson@flocksafety.com>

Sent: Thursday, November 19, 2020 12:27 PM

To: Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us>

Subject: Re: Flock Quotes

Hi Fwaak, apologies for the delay. I'll commit to getting this to you by the end of the day. I try to be as thorough as possible when putting these together and we've installed a TON of cameras since our last call (San Mateo, Atherton, and Rio Vista with Clearlake slated for Monday) so I'm catching up on a couple things. Will have this to you ASAP.

John

John Anderson

Territory Manager, Northern California

Flock Safety

408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



On Thu, Nov 19, 2020 at 8:55 AM Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us> wrote:

Hi John,

LT Menesini just came in my office and he was wondering if you were able to make the quotes he requested fully, and then all the phases including the maps for each phase. He is also interested in getting some documentation explaining the flock system to create the memo.

Regards,



Fwaak Manzoor, IT Analyst

Benicia Police Department

200 East L Street

Benicia CA 94510

Phone: 707.746.4258

Email: help@ci.benicia.ca.us

Email: FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us

From: [John Anderson](#)
To: [Fwaak Manzoor](#); [Edward Criado](#)
Subject: Flock webinar followup
Date: Thursday, October 08, 2020 3:39:48 PM

Hello Fwaak and Edward,

Thanks for attending my webinar yesterday morning. I hope hearing from a couple of our clients was beneficial and I really appreciate that you set aside the time to learn about Flock.

Are you interested in scheduling a time to discuss a few of the things that were brought up in the webinar?

We're already working with an HOA in Benicia (Bay Vista HOA) so I'd like to talk with you about setting up free access to those cameras and our network of PD cameras throughout the region. Vallejo already has 20 and I'm sure a bunch of your crime comes from there so this could be a really good tool for investigations.

Also, if you're open to it, I'd like to show you the solution and discuss what a Flock deployment in Benicia might look like.

Regardless, there are no strings attached if all you're interested in is setting up Free access to our network of cameras that are already in the field.

When are you available over the next week or so?

Thanks,

John

John Anderson
Territory Account Manager, Northern California
Flock Safety
408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



From: [John Anderson](#)
To: [Fwaak Manzoor](#); [Edward Criado](#)
Subject: Re: Flock webinar followup
Date: Tuesday, October 20, 2020 9:03:12 AM

Hello Fwaak and Edward, just following up on this...Are you available to chat with me for a few minutes next week?

At the least, I'd like to work towards getting your agency access to the privately purchased cameras in Benicia (Bay Vista HOA) as well as a ton of cameras that are owned by other nearby agencies like Vallejo and Hercules.

Thanks,

John

John Anderson
Territory Account Manager, Northern California
Flock Safety
408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



On Thu, Oct 8, 2020 at 3:39 PM John Anderson <john.anderson@flocksafety.com> wrote:

Hello Fwaak and Edward,

Thanks for attending my webinar yesterday morning. I hope hearing from a couple of our clients was beneficial and I really appreciate that you set aside the time to learn about Flock.

Are you interested in scheduling a time to discuss a few of the things that were brought up in the webinar?

We're already working with an HOA in Benicia (Bay Vista HOA) so I'd like to talk with you about setting up free access to those cameras and our network of PD cameras throughout the region. Vallejo already has 20 and I'm sure a bunch of your crime comes from there so this could be a really good tool for investigations.

Also, if you're open to it, I'd like to show you the solution and discuss what a Flock deployment in Benicia might look like.

Regardless, there are no strings attached if all you're interested in is setting up Free access to our network of cameras that are already in the field.

When are you available over the next week or so?

Thanks,

John

John Anderson

Territory Account Manager, Northern California

Flock Safety

408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



From: [John Anderson](#)
To: [Fwaak Manzoor](#)
Cc: [Edward Criado](#)
Subject: Re: Flock webinar followup
Date: Thursday, October 29, 2020 8:08:01 AM

Good morning Fwaak, and good to hear from you.

Yes, I'd be more than happy to talk with you about Flock and our partnership and integration with Axon. This is actually really good timing because we just had another HOA in Benicia sign up for their own cameras as of yesterday, so now there are two communities that have privately purchased cameras (Bridgeview Heights and Bay Vista). I'd like to talk with you about setting your agency up with access to those cameras as well.

The information from our previous deal is somewhat limited. We started the discussions back in November of 2019, and it looks like we were talking about approximately 20 LPR cameras although I do not see a deployment map in our system which means that we hadn't discussed/finalized specific locations.

It looks like our most recent conversations were around January 2020, and a TON has changed since then. We've released a new version of the camera which is about 10x more effective, and it's able to capture multiple lanes of traffic from a single camera compared to just one lane with the camera we would have discussed with you back in 2019.

We've also completely overhauled our Search Portal enabling a TON of new features like searching based on vehicle description (vehicle type, make, color, state detection, paper vs regular plates, more).

Here is some of my availability next week:

- Monday any time after 2:00
- Tuesday from 11:00 - 2:00 or after 3:00
- Wednesday after 2:00
- Thursday after 10:00

Do any of these work for you to talk a little about all of this, and I can show you a demo of our latest solution with all of the upgrades?

Thanks,

John

John Anderson
Territory Account Manager, Northern California
Flock Safety
408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



On Wed, Oct 28, 2020 at 3:07 PM Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us> wrote:

Hi John,

Thank you for reaching out. Yes, we would like to look at flock and possible look at integrating with Axon. There was documentation created by you guys with my predecessor to implement flock just wanted to see if I could get a copy of that information to look at before setting up a time to do a follow up chat.

Thank You,

Fwaak Manzoor

From: John Anderson <john.anderson@flocksafety.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 20, 2020 9:03 AM
To: Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us>; Edward Criado <ECriado@ci.benicia.ca.us>
Subject: Re: Flock webinar followup

Hello Fwaak and Edward, just following up on this...Are you available to chat with me for a few minutes next week?

At the least, I'd like to work towards getting your agency access to the privately purchased cameras in Benicia (Bay Vista HOA) as well as a ton of cameras that are owned by other nearby agencies like Vallejo and Hercules.

Thanks,

John

John Anderson

Territory Account Manager, Northern California

Flock Safety

408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



On Thu, Oct 8, 2020 at 3:39 PM John Anderson <john.anderson@flocksafety.com> wrote:

Hello Fwaak and Edward,

Thanks for attending my webinar yesterday morning. I hope hearing from a couple of our clients was beneficial and I really appreciate that you set aside the time to learn about Flock.

Are you interested in scheduling a time to discuss a few of the things that were brought up in the webinar?

We're already working with an HOA in Benicia (Bay Vista HOA) so I'd like to talk with you about setting up free access to those cameras and our network of PD cameras throughout the region. Vallejo already has 20 and I'm sure a bunch of your crime comes from there so this could be a really good tool for investigations.

Also, if you're open to it, I'd like to show you the solution and discuss what a Flock deployment in Benicia might look like.

Regardless, there are no strings attached if all you're interested in is setting up Free access to our network of cameras that are already in the field.

When are you available over the next week or so?

Thanks,

John

John Anderson

Territory Account Manager, Northern California

Flock Safety

408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



From: [John Anderson](#)
To: [Fwaak Manzoor](#)
Subject: Re: Regroup on Flock LPR project
Date: Wednesday, January 06, 2021 9:17:38 AM

Yes, that works. How about Wednesday to give him a little time when he gets back into the office...I'm relatively open on that day so what time is best for you?

Thanks,

John

John Anderson
Territory Manager, Northern California
Flock Safety
408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



On Wed, Jan 6, 2021 at 9:14 AM Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us> wrote:

Let's talk next week.

The LT that is working on this is off this week as he was here during the break. Can we look into this next week?

Fwaak

From: John Anderson <john.anderson@flocksafety.com>
Sent: Tuesday, January 5, 2021 5:49 PM
To: Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us>
Subject: Regroup on Flock LPR project

Hi Fwaak, I hope you had a great holiday season. Are you around for a call later this week? I'd like to regroup on the LPR project and talk a little about our next steps.

I'm available:

- Wednesday (tomorrow) after 10:00
- Thursday after 12:00
- Friday between 10:00 - 11:30 or after 1:00

Do any of these times work for you?

Thanks,

John

John Anderson

Territory Manager, Northern California

Flock Safety

408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



From: [John Anderson](#)
To: [Fwaak Manzoor](#)
Subject: Re: Regroup on Flock LPR project
Date: Tuesday, January 19, 2021 5:06:47 PM

Yep, here are a couple of things:

[REDACTED] This includes an overview with camera specs on P.10.

[REDACTED] that I put together for you a while back.

Also, as it stands right now I don't have anything scheduled for Thursday at 2:00 so I'd be more than happy to conference in for part of the meeting to answer questions, go over the deployment, talk about next steps, etc. Just let me know what I can do to help.

Thanks,

John

John Anderson
Territory Manager, Northern California
Flock Safety
408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



On Tue, Jan 19, 2021 at 4:51 PM Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us> wrote:

Could you please send some basic information on the cameras just in case they have technical questions for the meeting.

Fwaak

From: John Anderson <john.anderson@flocksafety.com>
Sent: Tuesday, January 19, 2021 4:48 PM
To: Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us>
Subject: Re: Regroup on Flock LPR project

Sounds good. Is there any additional info that I can get you before that meeting?

A couple of exciting updates: I've been working with Fairfield PD as well, and things have been progressing quickly. Vallejo and Vacaville already have Flock, so once you and Fairfield become clients you'll have a huge pool of cameras to leverage from the standpoint of camera sharing (Benicia, Vallejo, Fairfield, Vacaville).

Also, I was reviewing some of our recent results and noticed something interesting...We just installed solutions for Vallejo, Hercules, Milpitas, San Mateo, Atherton, Piedmont, Clearlake, and Anderson towards the end of 2020, and they're getting such good results that all 8 are already in the process of adding additional cameras. It blows me away every time I think about it because the results they're getting are actually typical.

Thanks,

John

John Anderson

Territory Manager, Northern California

Flock Safety

408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



On Tue, Jan 19, 2021 at 3:34 PM Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us> wrote:

Hi John,

I just got a request for a Flock meeting this Thursday at 2pm. I will contact you after the meeting to let you know what the game plan is.

Fwaak

From: John Anderson <john.anderson@flocksafety.com>

Sent: Thursday, January 14, 2021 4:52 PM

To: Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us>

Subject: Re: Regroup on Flock LPR project

Hey Fwaak, any chance you've heard back regarding a good time for next week?

Also, we're co-hosting a webinar with Ventura PD next week and I think it would be beneficial for you and your team to attend. I'll send over an invite in a separate email.

Thanks,

John

John Anderson

Territory Manager, Northern California

Flock Safety

408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



On Wed, Jan 6, 2021 at 2:59 PM John Anderson <john.anderson@flocksafety.com> wrote:

No worries. Tuesday 1/19 and Wednesday 1/20 are both wide open, and Thursday anytime after 10:00 works.

Just let me know what matches up on your end and I'll send out an invite.

Thanks,

John

John Anderson

Territory Manager, Northern California

Flock Safety

408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



On Wed, Jan 6, 2021 at 2:51 PM Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us>

wrote:

Just heard back from LT looks like wont be back next week either. Lets plan on two weeks from now sorry about that.

From: John Anderson <john.anderson@flocksafety.com>
Sent: Wednesday, January 6, 2021 9:17 AM
To: Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us>
Subject: Re: Regroup on Flock LPR project

Yes, that works. How about Wednesday to give him a little time when he gets back into the office...I'm relatively open on that day so what time is best for you?

Thanks,

John

John Anderson

Territory Manager, Northern California

Flock Safety

408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com



On Wed, Jan 6, 2021 at 9:14 AM Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us> wrote:

Let's talk next week.

The LT that is working on this is off this week as he was here during the break.
Can we look into this next week?

Fwaak

From: John Anderson <john.anderson@flocksafety.com>
Sent: Tuesday, January 5, 2021 5:49 PM
To: Fwaak Manzoor <FManzoor@ci.benicia.ca.us>
Subject: Regroup on Flock LPR project

Hi Fwaak, I hope you had a great holiday season. Are you around for a call later this week? I'd like to regroup on the LPR project and talk a little about our next steps.

I'm available:

- Wednesday (tomorrow) after 10:00
- Thursday after 12:00
- Friday between 10:00 - 11:30 or after 1:00

Do any of these times work for you?

Thanks,

John

John Anderson

Territory Manager, Northern California

Flock Safety

408.652.8530 | john.anderson@flocksafety.com

